

FOUL PLAY AT THE PARIS OLYMPICS: LEGAL ANALYSIS OF THE BOUT BETWEEN ANGELA CARINI AND TRANSGENDER BOXER

Sandra Moreno
Jurist, Doctor in Law
@ConSandramoreno

46 seconds were enough for Angela Carini to stop the unfair fight against Imane Khelif, after the latter had punched her violently in the face. And let's keep this illustration of the situation, because the fight we have witnessed today between Carini and Khelif was not sport, but violence, knowingly permitted by the IOC.

It's not about inclusion, it's not about equality; it's about contempt for women.

This unfair pugilistic combat has highlighted the well-founded reasons put forward by [female athletes](#) and [feminist organizations](#) to claim that the female category in sports should be for [women only](#). As we have seen, allowing trans self-identified males to fight against women is a measure lacking any legal justification, which breaks the rules of sports law and exposes the health and physical integrity of sportswomen in an unjustified, irrational and unnecessary manner, legitimizing violence against women. In addition, the opportunities to develop their sporting careers in dignified and fair conditions are annulled. With the stoppage of the bout, victory has been given to a person who has cheated gender and who has robbed Angela Carini of the opportunity to achieve sporting success in the Olympics that she could have had if she had competed against a woman.

The Carini vs. Khelif bout evidences the fallacy of the supposed inclusion and equality that is argued to allow born trans-self-identified males to compete in the female category. If it ends up excluding women, as happened in this fight, we cannot speak of inclusion. If it treats as equal those who are different, we cannot speak of equality, because the truth is that Angela Carini is a woman, being a carrier of XX chromosomes; and, carrying XY chromosomes, Imane Khelif is a man. And, therefore, the second person should compete in the male category, which is the one that corresponds to people of his sex.

Physiological and performance differences

Sports, in general, and combat sports, in particular, due to their competitiveness and roughness, imply a high risk of injuries and wounds, due to the direct physical contact and aggressiveness inherent to these disciplines. The physiological differences between men and women, besides being manifestly evident to anyone, are very well documented in [scientific and medical terms](#).

Men, on average, have greater muscle mass, strength, and power due to significant anatomical and physiological differences, especially hormonal ones, derived from testosterone, which have a determining influence on their physical development since puberty, and give them considerable advantages over women.

In fact, in contact sports, such as boxing, not only is segregation based on sex, but also on weight. If no one would find it acceptable to put males of different categories to compete, how is it possible that it is accepted that a born trans-identified male can compete in the female category of boxing? Well, for the same reason as always, because women's rights always end up being sacrificed in favor of men, whether they are hegemonic or diverse.

Safety Risks for Women

Allowing a born male to compete against a female in combat sports not only puts women at a disadvantage from a competition and winning chances perspective, but also significantly increases the risk of serious injury. Combat sports, such as boxing, martial arts, mixed martial arts (MMA) and the like, are already high-risk sports in and of themselves, due to the strength and aggressiveness required. Add to this the fact of having to compete against a person who starts from a position of advantage due to his anatomy, physiology and male socialization, and the danger increases exponentially, and what we are talking about is no longer reasonable risks, but **unacceptable violence**, which could be lethal.

An alarming example is the case of Fallon Fox, a transgender MMA fighter who has severely injured several female opponents, causing bone fractures and concussions. These violent incidents permitted by the sports authorities underscore the urgent need to review the decisions that allow such unequal competition, as they expose women to levels of brutality and aggressiveness that exceed the limits of contact sport and enter the realm of violence. This is a violation of women's dignity and human rights, which is clearly unacceptable in a society that claims to be civilized.

Infringement of Fair Play and other rules that protect women

Allowing trans-identified men to fight against women is to legitimize violence against women from institutions and states and to openly violate the fundamental rule of fair play, as recognized in the Olympic Charter, as well as the CEDAW, the Brighton Declaration and other legal instruments governing sports.

Therefore, the absurd criterion of the IOC that Imane Khelif and Lin Yu-Ting's eligibility to register and compete is considered approved since they have participated in the female category in several competitions and have female passports must be rejected, because the determining criterion in the verification of requirements and in the corresponding sport segregation, is the sex to which one belongs (notorious and scientifically verifiable fact), and not the felt gender (non-notorious fact and of impossible accreditation) that some countries allow in their internal laws.

It makes a mockery of the Olympic Charter, the Olympic Movement and the rights of women athletes to allow Khelif and Yu-Ting to participate in the women's boxing category, especially since at the recent IBA World Boxing Championships they were excluded for not "meeting the eligibility criteria", as they were found to have XY chromosomes, i.e. they are men, not women.

If the IOC authorities are the first to violate the rule of fair play that governs sport, by allowing the rules to be broken, to the [detriment of women's rights](#), what is the point of sporting categories and rules that govern sport and allow women to practice it? None. Adopting this criterion that degrades and excludes women from their own category is as unfair and arbitrary as preventing them from competing. We demand Fair Play!

Spain, August 1st, 2024

Author: Sandra Moreno

Publisher: IUSPORT 1997-2024